### Probing the nuclear symmetry energy at supra-saturation densities



## & collaborators:

Michael Gearheart, Weikang Lin, Will Newton, Justin Walker and Chang Xu, Texas A&M University-Commerce Lie-Wen Chen and Hongru Ma, Shanghai Jiao Tong University Wei-Zhou Jiang, Southeast University, Nanjing, China Plamen G. Krastev, San Diego State University Che-Ming Ko and Jun Xu, Texas A&M University, College Station De-Hua Wen, Southern China University of Technology Zhigang Xiao and Ming Zhang, Tsinghua University, China Gao-Chan Yong and Wei Zuo, Institute of Modern Physics, China

### Outline:

- 1.  $E_{sym}(\rho_0)$  and L from the isospin dependence of the nucleon global optical potentials
- 2. Why is the E<sub>sym</sub>(ρ) so uncertain at supra-saturation densities? ....., role of the short-range tensor force, .....
- 3. How can neutron stars be stable with super-soft symmetry energies?



## **E**<sub>sym</sub> (ρ) predicted by microscopic many-body theories



A.E. L. Dieperink et al., Phys. Rev. C68 (2003) 064307

### The $E_{sym}(\rho)$ from model predictions using popular effective interactions

Examples:



L.W. Chen, C.M. Ko and B.A. Li, Phys. Rev. C72, 064309 (2005); C76, 054316 (2007).

### The multifaceted influence of the isospin dependence of strong interaction and symmetry energy in nuclear physics and astrophysics

J.M. Lattimer and M. Prakash, Science Vol. 304 (2004) 536-542. A.W. Steiner, M. Prakash, J.M. Lattimer and P.J. Ellis, *Phys. Rep.* 411, 325 (2005).



## Promising Probes of the $E_{sym}(\rho)$ in Nuclear Reactions

#### At sub-saturation densities

- Global nucleon optical potentials from n/p-nucleus and (p,n) reactions
- Sizes of n-skins of unstable nuclei from total reaction cross sections
- Parity violating electron scattering studies of the n-skin in <sup>208</sup>Pb at JLab
- n/p ratio of FAST, pre-equilibrium nucleons
- Isospin fractionation and isoscaling in nuclear multifragmentation
- Isospin diffusion/transport
- Neutron-proton differential flow
- Neutron-proton correlation functions at low relative momenta
- t/<sup>3</sup>He ratio

#### **Towards supra-saturation densities**

- $\pi^{-}/\pi^{+}$  ratio, K<sup>+</sup>/K<sup>0</sup> ?
- Neutron-proton differential transverse flow
- n/p ratio of squeezed-out nucleons perpendicular to the reaction plane
- Nucleon elliptical flow at high transverse momentum
- t-<sup>3</sup>He differential and difference transverse flow

### (1) Correlations of multi-observable are important

(2) Detecting neutrons simultaneously with charged particles is critical

B.A. Li, L.W. Chen and C.M. Ko, Physics Reports 464, 113 (2008)

### Symmetry energy and the isospin-dependence of strong interaction

Lane potential  $U_{n/p} = U_0 \pm U_{sym}\delta$ 

Symmetry energy 
$$E_{sym}(\rho) = \frac{1}{6} \frac{\partial (t + U_0)}{\partial k} |_{k_F} k_F + \frac{1}{2} U_{sym}(\rho, k_F)$$

Effective mass 
$$m^*/m = \left[1 + \frac{m}{k_F} \frac{\partial U_0}{\partial k}|_{k_F}\right]^{-1}$$

$$E_{sym}(\rho) = \frac{1}{3} \frac{\hbar^2 k_F^2}{2m^*} + \frac{1}{2} U_{sym}(\rho, k_F)$$

J. Dabrowski, Physics Letters 8, 90 (1964)

K. A. Brueckner and J. Dabrowski, Phys. Rev. 134, B722 (1964); J. Dabrowski and P. Haensel, Phys. Lett. B 42, 163 (1972); Phys. Rev. C 7, 916 (1973); Can. J. Phys. 52, 1768 (1974).

# Symmetry energy and its density slope at arbitrary density based on the Hugenholtz-Van Hove (HVH) theorem

N. M. Hugenholtz, L. Van Hove, Physica 24, 363 (1958)

$$\begin{array}{c} \text{Single-particle potential}\\ \text{Kinetic energy}\\ t(k_F^n) + U_n(\rho,\delta,k_F^n) = \frac{\partial\xi}{\partial\rho_n},\\ t(k_F^p) + U_p(\rho,\delta,k_F^p) = \frac{\partial\xi}{\partial\rho_p}, \end{array}$$

$$k_F^n = k_F (1+\delta)^{1/3}, k_F^p = k_F (1-\delta)^{1/3}$$

$$\begin{split} E_{sym}(\rho) &= \frac{1}{3} \frac{\hbar^2 k_F^2}{2m^*} + \frac{1}{2} U_{sym}(\rho, k_F) \\ L(\rho) &= \frac{2}{3} \frac{\hbar^2 k_F^2}{2m^*} + \frac{3}{2} U_{sym}(\rho, k_F) + \frac{\partial U_{sym}}{\partial k}|_{k_F} k_F \\ \text{C. Xu, B.A. Li and L.W. Chen} \quad \underbrace{\text{arXiv:1006.4321}} \end{split}$$

### Symmetry potential at saturation density from global nucleon optical potentials

Systematics based on world data accumulated since 1969:

- (1) Single particle energy levels from pick-up and stripping reaction
- (2) Neutron and proton scattering on the same target at about the same energy
- (3) Proton scattering on isotopes of the same element
- (4) (p,n) charge exchange reactions



Constraining the symmetry energy near saturation density using global nucleon optical potentials  $L(a_0)$ ,  $a = a_0$ , a

$$E_{sym}(\rho) = E_{sym}(\rho_0) + \frac{L(\rho_0)}{3} (\frac{\rho - \rho_0}{\rho_0}) + O((\frac{\rho - \rho_0}{\rho_0})^2)$$



### Latest constraints on the symmetry energy and its density slope at saturation

GOP: global optical potentials (Lane potentials) C. Xu et al., arxiv:1006.4321



Iso. Diff & double n/p (ImQMD, 2009), M. B. Tsang et al., PRL92, 122701 (2009).

Iso Diff. (IBUU04, 2005), L.W. Chen et al., PRL94, 32701 (2005)

IAS+LDM (2009), Danielewicz and J. Lee, NPA818, 36 (2009)

PDR (2010) of <sup>68</sup>Ni and <sup>132</sup>Sn, A. Carbone et al., PRC81, 041301 (2010).

PDR (2007) in <sup>208</sup>Pb Land/GSI, PRC76, 051603 (2007)

SHF+N-skin of Sn isotopes, Chen et al., arxiv:1004.4672

**38** Isoscaling (2007), D.Shetty et al. PRC76, 024606 (2007)

DM+N-Skin (1): M. Centelles et al., PRL102, 122502 (2009)

DM+N-Skin (2): M. Warda et al., PRC80, 024316 (2009)



### Effects of the symmetry energy on the pasta phase in neutron star crust



Liquid drop model + Wigner-Seitz approximation including dripped neutrons and the electrons at beta equilibrium

# Symmetry (isovector) potential and its major uncertainties

• Isospin-dependence of NN correlations and the tensor force Experimental indication: BNL (p,p'pp) and (p,p'pn) and JLab (e,e'pp) and (e,e'pn) experiments,

A. Tang et al., PRL 90, 042302 (2003); E. Piasetzky et al., PRL97, 162504 (2006);

B. R. Subedi et al. Science 320,1476 (2008).....

Theories: MANY papers,

R. Schiavilla et al., PRL 98, 132501 (2007); M. Alvioli et al., PRL 100, 162503 (2008);

L. Frankfurt, M. Sargsian and M. Strikman; T. Neff, H. Feldmeier; W. Dickhoff, Wiringa, .....

Within an interacting Fermi gas model: Structure of the nucleus, M.A. Preston and R.K. Bhaduri (1975)

 $U_{sym}(k_F,\rho) = \frac{1}{4}\rho \int [V_{T1}(r_{ij})f^{T1}(r_{ij}) - V_{T0}(r_{ij})f^{T0}(r_{ij})]d^3r_{ij}$ 

•Spin-isospin dependence of 3-body forces

Short-range tensor force due to rho meson exchange

$$V_{T0} = V'_{np}$$
 (n-p pair in the T=0 state)  
 $V_{T1} = V_{nn} = V_{pp} = V_{np}$  (charge independence in the T=1 state)

### Isospin-dependence of Short Range NN Correlations and Tensor Force



Two-nucleon knockout by an electron R Subedi et al. Science 320, 1475 (2008)

CERN Courier Jan 27, 2009

Theory explains the pn pair dominance in terms of the tensor force: Schiavilla, Wiringa, Pieper and Carlson, Phys. Rev. Lett. 98, 132501 (2007)



Figure 3: The average fraction of nucleons in the various initial state configurations of 12C.

## Dominance of the isosinglet (T=0) interaction



$$E_{sym}(\rho) = \frac{1}{2} \frac{\partial E}{\partial \delta^2} \approx E(\rho)_{\text{pure neutron matter}} - E(\rho)_{\text{symmetric nuclear matter}}$$



# The short and long range tensor force



VOLUME 21, NUMBER 3

#### **Parametrization of the Paris** N-N potential

M. Lacombe, B. Loiseau, J. M. Richard, and R. Vinh Mau

Division de Physique Théorique, Institut de Physique Nucléaire, Orsay 91406, France and LPTPE, Université Pierre et Marie Curie, Paris 75230, France

J. Côté, P. Pirès, and R. de Tourreil

Division de Physique Théorique, Institut Physique de Nucléaire, Orsay 91406, France (Received 27 July 1979)

small values of r, there is no compelling theoretical reason to believe the validity of our potential in the region  $r \leq 0.8$  fm since the short range (SR) part of the interaction is related to exchange of heavier systems and/or to effects of subhadronic constituents such as quarks, gluons, etc. At presfew degrees of freedom. Along this line, we proposed<sup>3</sup> to describe the core with a very simple phenomenological model; namely, the long and intermediate range  $(\pi + 2\pi + \omega)$  potential is cut off rather sharply at internucleon distance  $\gamma \sim 0.8$  fm and the short range ( $\gamma \leq 0.8$  fm) is described simply by a constant soft core. This introduces the



(1) including only pion contribution to the tensor force(2) using a hard-core cut-off distance of 0.8 fm

# Uncertainty of tensor force at short distance

Takaharu Otsuka et al., PRL 95, 232502 (2005); PRL 97, 162501 (2006)



[21] J. P. Schiffer et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 92, 162501 (2004).

# In-medium properties of the short-range tensor force

$$V_T^{\rho}(r) = \frac{f_{N_{\rho}}^2 m_{\rho}}{4\pi} \tau_1 \cdot \tau_2 \left(S_{12} \left[\frac{e^{-m_{\rho}r}}{(m_{\rho}r)^3} + \frac{e^{-m_{\rho}r}}{(m_{\rho}r)^2} + \frac{e^{-m_{\rho}r}}{3m_{\rho}r}\right]\right)$$
$$V_T^{\pi}(r) = \frac{f_{N_{\pi}}^2 m_{\pi}}{4\pi} \tau_1 \cdot \tau_2 \left(-S_{12} \left[\frac{e^{-m_{\pi}r}}{(m_{\pi}r)^3} + \frac{e^{-m_{\pi}r}}{(m_{\pi}r)^2} + \frac{e^{-m_{\pi}r}}{3m_{\pi}r}\right]$$

G.E. Brown and Mannque Rho, PLB 237, 3 (1990)

Brown-Rho scaling (BRS)

$$\frac{m_{\rho}^{\star}}{m_{\rho}} = 1 - \alpha_{BR} \cdot \frac{\rho}{\rho_0}$$

Pion mass unchanged

G.E. Brown and Mannque Rho, PRL 66, 2720 (1991); Phys Rep. 396, 1 (2004)

### Strength of the total tensor force



# Short-range properties of tensor force and the high-density behavior of nuclear symmetry energy



Chang Xu and Bao-An Li, Phys. Rev. C81, 064612 (2010).

The proton fraction x at ß-equilibrium in proto-neutron stars is determined by

$$x = 0.048[E_{sym}(\rho) / E_{sym}(\rho_0)]^3(\rho / \rho_0)(1 - 2x)^3$$

The critical proton fraction for direct URCA process to happen is  $X_p=0.14$  for npeµ matter obtained from energy-momentum conservation on the proton Fermi surface



### Can the symmetry energy become negative at high densities?

Yes, it happens when the tensor force due to rho exchange in the T=0 channel dominates At high densities, the energy of pure neutron matter can be lower than symmetric matter leading to negative symmetry energy

Pandharipande V R and Garde V K 1972 Phys. Lett. B 39 608

Wiringa R B, Fiks V and Fabrocini A 1988 Phys. Rev. C 38 1010

Kutschera M 1994 Phys. Lett. B 340 1

Example: proton fractions with interactions/models leading to negative symmetry energy

M. Kutschera et al., Acta Physica Polonica B37 (2006)



### **Dirac-Brueckner-Hartree-Fock Calculations**

P. G. KRASTEV AND F. SAMMARRUCA PHYSICAL REVIEW C 74, 025808 (2006)



### Neutron star and $\beta$ -stable ring-diagram equation of state Huan Dong and T. T. S. Kuo

Department of Physics and Astronomy, Stony Brook University, Stony Brook, NY 11794-3800, USA\*

R. Machleidt

Department of Physics, University of Idaho, Moscow, Idaho 83844, USA



Phys. Rev. C80, 065803 (2009)

FIG. 9: Proton fraction of  $\beta$ -stable neutron star from realistic NN potentials. Symbols are BonnA(\*), CDBonn( $\circ$ ), Argonne V18 ( $\Box$ ) and Nijemgen ( $\times$ ). The interaction  $V_{low-k}$  plus TBF' is used.

#### **Circumstantial Evidence for a Super-soft Symmetry Energy at Supra-saturation Densities**



A super-soft nuclear symmetry energy is favored by the FOPI data!!!

Z.G. Xiao, B.A. Li, L.W. Chen, G.C. Yong and M. Zhang, Phys. Rev. Lett. 102 (2009) 062502

A challenge: how can neutron stars be stable with a super-soft symmetry energy? If the symmetry energy is too soft, then a mechanical instability will occur when dP/dp is negative, neutron stars will then all collapse while they do exist in nature



TOV equation: a condition at hydrodynamical equilibrium

 $dP/d\rho < 0$  if E'sym is big and negative (super-soft)

# **Comments about the super-soft symmetry energy**

Unpleasant, unwelcome, annoying !

E. Chabanat, P. Bonche, P. Haensel, J. Meyer, and R. Schaeffer, NPA627, 710 (1997); NPA635, 231 (1998). Repeated by several others in some other papers

# **Unphysical** !

Norman Glennding, Compact Stars, Springer, ISBN: 0387989773. Quoted by several people in a number of papers



# Neutron stars as a natural testing ground of grand unification theories of fundamental forces?



Connecting Quarks with the Cosmos: <u>Eleven Science Questions for the New</u> <u>Century</u>, Committee on the Physics of the Universe, National Research Council

- What is the dark matter?
- What is the nature of the dark energy?
- How did the universe begin?
- What is gravity?
- What are the masses of the neutrinos, and how have they shaped the evolution of the universe?
- How do cosmic accelerators work and what are they accelerating?
- Are protons unstable?
- Are there new states of matter at exceedingly high density and temperature?
- Are there additional spacetime dimensions?
- How were the elements from iron to uranium made?
- Is a new theory of matter and light needed at the highest energies?

Composition and structure determined by the 4 forces TOGETHER

### Do we really know gravity at short distance?

In grand unification theories, conventional gravity has to be modified due to either geometrical effects of extra space-time dimensions at short length, a new boson proposed in the supersymmetric extension of the standard model, or the 5<sup>th</sup> force

$$F(r) = G \frac{m_1 m_2}{r^{2+\epsilon}}$$
String theorists have published TONS of papers  
on the extra space-time dimensions  
N. Arkani-Hamed et al., Phys Lett. B 429, 263–272 (1998); J.C. Long et al., Nature 421, 922 (2003);  
C.D. Hoyle, Nature 421, 899 (2003)  
In terms of the gravitational potential  
 $V(r) = -G \frac{m_1 m_2}{r} [1 + \alpha e^{-r/\lambda}]$ .  
Yukawa potential due to the exchange of a  
new boson proposed in the super-symmetric  
extension of the Standard Model of the Grand  
Unification Theory, or the fifth force

Yasunori Fujii, Nature 234, 5-7 (1971); G.W. Gibbons and B.F. Whiting, Nature 291, 636 - 638 (1981)

The neutral spin-1 gauge boson U is a candidate, it is light and weakly interacting, Pierre Fayet, PLB675, 267 (2009), C. Boehm, D. Hooper, J. Silk, M. Casse and J. Paul, PRL, 92, 101301 (2004).

# TESTS OF THE GRAVITATIONAL INVERSE-SQUARE LAW

E.G. Adelberger, B.R. Heckel, and A.E. Nelson Department of Physics, University of Washington, Seattle, Washington 98195-1560;

Annu. Rev. Nucl. Part. Sci. 53 (2003) 77 Prog. In Part. and Nucl. Phys., 62 (2009) 102

# Upper limits on the strength $\alpha$ and range $\lambda$ of the Yukawa term

M.I. Krivoruchenko et al., PRD 79, 125023 (2009) E.G. Adelberger et al., PRL 98, 131104 (2007) D.J. Kapner et al., PRL 98, 021101 (2007)

Serge Reynaud et al., Int. J. Mod. Phys. A20, 2294 (2005)

$$V(r) = -G \frac{m_1 m_2}{r} [1 + \alpha e^{-r/\lambda}],$$
  
$$g^2 = \pm 4\pi G_{\infty} \mu^2 \alpha \text{ where } \mu = 1/\lambda$$



A motivation of the deep space gravity probe

### Influences of the Yukawa term on Neutron Stars

Yasunori Fujii J. Audouze et al. (eds.), Large Scale Structures of the Universe, 471–477. © 1988 by the IAU.

I next emphasize that the 5-th force is simply part of the matter system in general relativity. Consequently Einstein's equation remains unchanged. The only change one expects to occur is in the equation of state. And probably the first reasonable thing to do is to appeal to the mean field approximation.[11]

$$\varepsilon_{\rm UB} = \frac{1}{2V} \int \rho(\vec{x}_1) \frac{g^2}{4\pi} \frac{e^{-\mu r}}{r} \rho(\vec{x}_2) d\vec{x}_1 d\vec{x}_2 = \frac{1}{2} \frac{g^2}{\mu^2} \rho^2,$$

 $P_{UB} = \frac{1}{2} \frac{g^2 \rho^2}{\mu^2} \left( 1 - \frac{2\rho}{\mu} \frac{\partial \mu}{\partial \rho} \right).$ 

Assuming a constant boson mass independent of the density, the extra pressure is then

$$P_{UB} = \varepsilon_{UB} = \frac{1}{2} \frac{g^2}{\mu^2} \rho^2 \tag{4}$$

### Supersoft Symmetry Energy Encountering Non-Newtonian Gravity in Neutron Stars De-Hua Wen, Bao-An Li and Lie-Wen Chen, PRL 103, 211102 (2009)







-Values of the scattering lengths for different atoms (nuclei) are not calculated precisely from "first principles" because of complexity of the corresponding nuclei models

11.02.09

INSTITUT MAX VON LAUE - PAUL LANGEVIN

V.V.Nesvizhevsky

Gravitationally bound quantum states of neutrons

V.V. Nesvizhevsky et al., Nature-Physics 6, 114 (2010)

# Summary

- The nuclear symmetry energy is still very uncertain especially at high densities due to mainly (1) 3-body force, (2) short-range tensor force and (3) short-range nucleon-nucleon correlation functions
- Symmetry energy affects many properties of neutron stars
- Neutron stars are natural testing ground of grand unification theories. High-density symmetry energy, gravity at short distance, possible extra space-time dimensions are all closely related and have to be considered simultaneously.

Gravity is least known among all 4 forces despite being the first force discovered ----- C.D. Hoyle, Nature 421, 899 (2003)

A lot more manuscripts on gravity than nuclear theory are posted at Arxiv every day

The 11<sup>th</sup> International Conference on Nucleus-Nucleus Collisions (NN2012)

# May 27-June 1, 2012 Hyatt Regency, San Antonio, Texas

Local Organizing Committee: Carlos Bertulani, Cody Folden, Kris Hagel, John Hardy, Bao-An Li (Co-Chair), Joseph B. Natowitz (Co-Chair), Ralf Rapp, Livius Trache and Sherry J.Yennello

